



TAMBELLINI GROUP
TRUSTED MARKET ADVISORS®

Beyond the Bottom Line: Redefining ROI in the Era of Higher Ed Modernization

WHITE PAPER

By Matthew Winn, PhD
July 2025

Contents

Abstract	3
Executive Summary	4
Introduction: The Reality of Modernization in Higher Education	4
A Broader Definition of ROI	4
Why Modernization Fails to Deliver ROI And How to Fix It	5
The Cost of Inaction: What Happens When Institutions Don't Modernize?	6
Modeling ROI: A Realistic Framework for Institutional Leaders	7
Modernization as a Long-Term Investment	8
Recommendations for Institutional Leaders	9
Conclusion: A Call for Realism and Resolve	10
Methodology	11
Future Campus Impacts	12
About Tambellini Group, Terms of Use, and Disclaimer	13

Abstract

Technology modernization in higher education is no longer a question of “if” but “when.” As vendors sunset support for legacy on-premises systems and shift toward SaaS-based solutions, institutions will be compelled to modernize, whether proactively or reactively. While modernization is often marketed as a strategic move toward efficiency, agility, and data-informed decision-making, the true return on investment (ROI) is far more nuanced. The path to realizing any ROI, financial or otherwise, is complicated by high upfront costs, significant change management demands, entrenched institutional cultures, and the uncertain adoption of best practices. For many institutions, especially those that are resource-constrained or risk-averse, these challenges may delay or dilute the perceived benefits. This paper aims to level-set expectations, define a broader concept of ROI, and provide guidance on navigating the complexity of modernization without overpromising outcomes.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In an era defined by digital transformation, the modernization of technology systems in higher education is no longer optional; it is inevitable. With vendors sunsetting support for legacy platforms and institutions facing growing demands for agility, responsiveness, and data-informed decision-making, the decision to modernize is increasingly being forced by external pressures. However, the return on investment (ROI) narrative tied to modernization is often over-simplified and is often based solely on financial measures. This white paper aims to redefine ROI in a way that acknowledges both the strategic and operational complexity of modernization, outlines a framework to evaluate real-world impact, and guides institutions in making informed, realistic decisions about their digital future.

INTRODUCTION: THE REALITY OF MODERNIZATION IN HIGHER EDUCATION

For decades, higher education institutions have operated with legacy systems that, while once cutting-edge, now constrain innovation. From outdated student systems (SIS) to rigid financial management tools, these platforms often require extensive manual workarounds, inhibit integration, and limit institutional agility.

Modernization, typically involving a shift from on-premises infrastructure to cloud-based, software-as-a-service (SaaS) ecosystems, offers a compelling vision: operational efficiency, streamlined workflows, enhanced user experience, and better data visibility. But modernization is not a magic wand. It is a capital-intensive, organizationally disruptive process that often fails to deliver its full promise when treated as a simple technology upgrade.

Just as no university builds a new classroom building solely to save money, no institution should expect immediate cost savings from technology modernization. Instead, it should be treated as a strategic investment, an enabler of new capabilities and long-term institutional resilience.

A BROADER DEFINITION OF ROI

Traditionally, ROI is calculated using a simple formula:

$$\text{ROI} = (\text{Net Benefit} / \text{Investment Cost}) \times 100$$

In a higher ed context, this approach fails to capture the complexity of modernization initiatives. Instead, we assert a multi-dimensional view of ROI that encompasses:

- **Strategic ROI** – Alignment with institutional mission, future readiness, and differentiation
- **Operational ROI** – Gains in process efficiency, data access, and user satisfaction
- **Cultural ROI** – Ability to foster innovation, accountability, and responsiveness

- **Opportunity ROI** – Costs of inaction, including missed enrollment, funding, and partnership opportunities

Institutions must recognize that the ROI of modernization is not always immediate, easily quantifiable, or purely financial. Like a new campus building or academic program, its value is measured in how it enables growth, enhances reputation, and prepares the institution for future success.

WHY MODERNIZATION FAILS TO DELIVER ROI AND HOW TO FIX IT

Many institutions underestimate what it truly takes to unlock ROI from modernization. Common barriers include:

- **Legacy Policies and Practices** – Institutions often deploy new tools while clinging to outdated policies created in a pre-digital world. This is like moving into a new building but refusing to update the curriculum taught within it.

The Fix: Invest in process review and improvement. Revise outdated policies to align with modern digital tools and practices. This ensures that new technologies are fully utilized and integrated into the institution's operations.

- **Failure to Adopt Best Practices** – Higher education frequently resists business best practices, particularly in finance, HR, and operations. By not adapting to modern, data-driven models, institutions leave significant value on the table. Agentic AI will exacerbate the gap between those who can adopt new process models and those who cannot.

The Fix: Implement industry best practices in finance, HR, and operations. This helps institutions leverage modern, data-driven models to maximize value and improve decision-making.

- **Lack of Organizational Alignment** – Modernization efforts that serve departmental needs rather than institutional priorities can create localized gains in specific areas but rarely create broader alignment toward institutional goals. These localized gains can further reinforce departmental or domain silos for data and operations. Projects must be tied to the “true north” goals of the institution: student success, sustainability, and mission fulfillment.

The Fix: Tie modernization efforts to institutional priorities such as student success, sustainability, and mission fulfillment. This creates broader alignment and prevents departmental silos.

- **Inadequate Change Management** – Institutions often underestimate the cultural and procedural shifts required. Teams must commit to new ways of working, or risk undermining the entire initiative.

The Fix: Ensure all stakeholders feel heard, and engage everyone in the cultural and procedural shifts required for modernization. Provide training and support to ensure teams adopt new ways of working.

Beyond the Bottom Line: Redefining ROI in the Era of Higher Ed Modernization

- **Siloed Decision-Making** – Modernization efforts often falter when decisions are made in isolation by individual departments rather than through coordinated, institution-wide planning. Without cross-functional alignment, institutions risk duplicating efforts, misallocating resources, and implementing systems that don't integrate or scale effectively.

The Fix: Foster cross-functional alignment in planning and decision-making. This prevents duplication of efforts, misallocation of resources, and ensures systems integrate and scale effectively.

- **Failure to Assess and Align Talent** – Institutions often overlook the importance of evaluating whether their workforce has the skills needed to execute and sustain modernization. Without assessing talent before, during, and after major initiatives, institutions risk misalignment between new systems and existing talent capabilities. Future-ready operations require future-ready teams.

The Fix: Evaluate whether the workforce has the skills needed to execute and sustain modernization. Invest in reskilling existing staff and recruiting talent that can thrive in a digital-first environment.

THE COST OF INACTION: WHAT HAPPENS WHEN INSTITUTIONS DON'T MODERNIZE?

Too often, institutions analyze the cost of modernization but ignore the cost of stagnation. Consider:

- **Rising Student Expectations** – Today's learners expect seamless, mobile-first, digital experiences. These expectations increase with each new cohort of learners. Legacy systems that remain in the environment create friction that increases over time thus increasing the pressure on enrollment and retention.
- **Operational Inefficiency** – Manual workflows and disconnected systems waste valuable staff time and lead to errors that compromise service quality, student experience, and compliance.
- **Inability to Respond to Market Changes** – Traditional governance models can't match the speed of change in workforce needs, funding models, and learning modalities. Institutions that can't adapt quickly will fall behind more agile competitors, including for-profit and non-traditional providers.

Southern New Hampshire University and Arizona State University, for example, have capitalized on technology and operational innovation to scale rapidly and meet emerging learner demands. Their success highlights the opportunity cost facing traditional institutions that delay modernization.

Modeling ROI:

A Realistic Framework for Institutional Leaders

To help institutions approach ROI modeling more effectively, consider the following structured process.

1. Define the Scope of Modernization

Modernization exists on a spectrum, from adopting a few cloud-based tools to re-architecting the entire operational and technology ecosystem and reimagining operational workflows. Scope determines potential value, complexity, and risk.

2. Identify Value Levers

Create a value tree to identify all possible benefits:

- | | |
|--|--|
| ☒ Improved student engagement | ☒ Reduced IT maintenance costs |
| ☒ Increased user productivity | ☒ Better regulatory compliance |
| ☒ Enhanced analytics and reporting | |

3. Map Value Blockers

Identify and quantify obstacles such as:

- | | |
|--|---|
| ☒ Misaligned project goals | ☒ Leadership turnover |
| ☒ Financial constraints | ☒ Low adoption rates |
| ☒ Resistance to change | |

MODERNIZATION AS A LONG-TERM INVESTMENT

Just as no one expects a new science building to generate cost savings overnight, no one should expect modernization to “pay for itself” in year one. Institutions invest in buildings to attract students, enable new research, and create inspiring learning environments. Technology modernization should be viewed through the same lens.

Moreover, modernization is an ongoing commitment and not merely a one-time project. Systems must be maintained, updated, and evolved to remain relevant. Failing to do so re-creates the conditions that made the original systems obsolete.

Recommendations for Institutional Leaders

1 Think Like a Business

Adopt a proactive, data-driven mindset. Use dashboards, KPIs, OKRs, and predictive analytics to guide decisions and monitor ROI.

2 Align Technology with Strategy

Tie every modernization initiative to a core institutional goal. Ask: Will this improve enrollment? Advance our mission? Reduce risk? If the answer to these is no, it will be reflected in minimal or negative ROI.

3 Budget for Change Management

Set aside at least 15-20% of your total project budget for training, communications, policy and process updates, and change leadership. This is often the make-or-break factor.

4 Modernize Policies Alongside Technology

Revise institutional policies to match or exceed the capabilities and expectations of modern systems. Like staffing assessment and refinement, policy modernization is a sustained process rather than a one-and-done activity. Outdated rules will only constrain the benefits of modernization.

5 Build a Coalition of Champions

Modernization requires more than executive sponsorship; it demands a visible, cross-functional coalition that actively drives change. Go beyond forming a steering committee; empower this group with decision-making authority, dedicated resources, and a clear mandate to lead the institution through transformation while also advocating for change within their own spheres of influence across campus.

6 Evaluate the Cost of Doing Nothing

Factor in opportunity costs; missed enrollment, staff burnout, and poor data visibility as part of every ROI discussion.

7 Choose Fit Over Flash

Carefully evaluate the full landscape of vendor solutions, not just the most hyped or feature-rich offerings. The latest and greatest tools may not be the best fit for every institution. Just as not every driver needs a Ferrari when a Honda Accord will reliably get them where they need to go, institutions should prioritize solutions that align with their goals, capacity, and culture. A well-matched, sustainable platform often delivers more value than a high-end system that strains budgets or exceeds operational readiness.

8 Align Talent Strategy with Modernization Goals

Modernization is not just about systems—it's about people. Institutions must align hiring, staffing, and professional development with the new ways of working that modernization demands. This includes identifying future skill needs, reskilling existing staff, and recruiting talent that can thrive in a digital-first environment.

CONCLUSION: A CALL FOR REALISM AND RESOLVE

Modernization is not a silver bullet, nor is it a guaranteed path to cost savings. It is a strategic investment in institutional agility, resilience, and long-term relevance. Institutions that approach modernization with a clear understanding of the trade-offs, a commitment to best practices, and a willingness to rethink how they operate will unlock far more than financial ROI, they will secure their place in the future of higher education.

Some may argue that investing in modernization diverts funds from direct student support. But this is a false dichotomy. In the corporate world, operational effectiveness and agility are seen as foundational to long-term success—and the same applies to higher education. Streamlined systems, responsive workflows, and data-informed decision-making directly impact the student experience by enabling faster service, better advising, and more personalized learning pathways. In turbulent times, institutions that invest in operational resilience are better positioned to serve students, not less.

Let us move beyond the bottom line and redefine ROI as what it truly is: Return on Innovation, Return on Impact, and Return on Institutional Relevance.

METHODOLOGY

Tambellini maintains, updates, and delivers the most comprehensive database of institution technology profiles available. The company began tracking this data in 2001 in response to client requests, and today provides data to global organizations and institutions. Tambellini gathers and maintains publicly available data on higher education technology selections from a variety of sources, including press releases, institution materials (e.g., project websites, presentations), news articles, and vendor case studies. Tambellini conducts primary research including surveys and interviews with institutions. Institutions provide updates to technology profiles through online research portals on various Tambellini websites.

While other firms have historically provided some information and opinions regarding market trends, the data to support these opinions has typically been provided by vendors minus detailed customer lists or by survey responses, which have limited response rates. Without the benefit of detailed, verified technology profiles, institutions, vendors, consultants, and financial analysts were generally left on their own to try and find enough critical technology data to support important decisions. Tambellini's Education Institution Technology Profile Database® is used by institutions to find peers with similar technology implementations, for benchmarking comparisons, and vendor references. Vendors, consultants, financial analysts, investors, and venture capitalists also utilize the database to gain insight into market-share data and other facts about vendor sales history that are not available from any other single source. Prior to the availability of this database, it was difficult to track and understand market-share data by vendor and vendor product.

FUTURE CAMPUS IMPACTS

The Future Campus™ Framework is Tambellini's innovative tool for generating strategic-level conversations and action for appropriate investments and divestments across the four key pillars of people, process, data, and technology. The Framework is scored across ten key higher education workspaces.

Technology modernization in higher education affects the following Future Campus workspaces:

Recruit and Retain

Technology modernization initiatives aim to improve student engagement and experience, which can enhance recruitment and retention rates. By providing seamless, mobile-first, digital experiences, institutions can meet the rising expectations of today's learners, thereby reducing friction and increasing enrollment and retention.

Employ

Technology modernization involves aligning talent strategy with modernization goals. Institutions must ensure their workforce has the necessary skills to support and sustain modernization efforts. This includes identifying future skill needs, reskilling existing staff, and recruiting talent that can thrive in a digital-first environment.

Fundraise

Improvement in institutional operations and reputation through technology modernization can positively impact fundraising efforts. Enhanced data visibility and operational efficiency can provide better insights for potential donors and stakeholders.

Operations

The shift to cloud-based, software-as-a-service (SaaS) ecosystems will streamline workflows, enhance user experience, and improve data visibility. This operational efficiency is a key outcome of technology modernization.

Governance

Technology modernization requires institutions to adopt a proactive, data-driven mindset and align technology with core institutional goals. This involves revisiting and revising institutional policies to match or exceed the capabilities and expectations of modern systems.

Risk

Technology modernization enables institutions to address potential risks, such as costs associated with not acting, missed enrollment opportunities, staff workload issues, and limited data visibility, supporting continued competitiveness and relevance.

Innovate

Technology modernization fosters a culture of innovation by enabling institutions to adopt new process models and best practices. This cultural shift is essential for long-term success and institutional agility.

Beyond the Bottom Line: Redefining ROI in the Era of Higher Ed Modernization

ABOUT TAMBELLINI GROUP

The Tambellini Group has been the leading provider of unbiased and proprietary research and advisory services to higher education since 2001. Our mission is to equip educational institutions with the impartial insights, tools, and market predictions needed to make informed technology decisions while maximizing return-on-investment and constituent experience. We empower institutions to overcome challenges, seize opportunities, and pave the way toward a brighter future for higher education.

TERMS OF USE

This report contains confidential, proprietary and trade secret information by The Tambellini Group, LLC. Unauthorized distribution is strictly prohibited. All rights reserved. No portion of this report and strategic analysis may be reproduced, given, lent, resold or disclosed in whole or in part without the written permission of and attribution to The Tambellini Group, LLC. Only the person, institution, school, company or organization that has licensed this report may access and use the report. You may print and use this report inside your institution, school, organization or company as part of an institution, school, organization or company license. You may not distribute this report, in whole or part, to others outside of your institution, school, organization, or company unless you have specifically licensed the rights to distribute the report for external use. The Tambellini Group offers no specific guarantee regarding the accuracy or completeness of the information presented, but The Tambellini Group makes every reasonable effort to present the most reliable information available. The Tambellini Group assumes no liability for errors, omissions or discrepancies in the information contained in this report.

The research for this report is not sponsored, and The Tambellini Group relies on fees from its Peertelligent® and Market InsightsSM subscription services for publication. As such, The Tambellini Group issues each copy of the report to the institution, school, organization or company that licenses it. Trade secret and other violations are therefore enforced to the fullest extent.

The Tambellini Group and The Tambellini Group logo are trademarks or service marks of The Tambellini Group, and may be registered in the US, other countries or both. Other third-party trademarks or service marks are property of their respective owners.

DISCLAIMER

The Tambellini Group does not recommend or endorse any vendor solutions for higher education. The Tambellini Group is an independent research firm. The Tambellini Group provides selected information about vendors based on research. The Tambellini Group makes every effort to validate all of the

information presented in this report and performs all research in good faith. The Tambellini Group relies on publicly available information, interviews with higher education institutions and vendor feedback in order to prepare and publish reports which contain timely and helpful points of interest. By using information in this report, you acknowledge that you do so at your own risk. No information contained in this report shall create any warranty or liability. You should obtain any additional information necessary to make an informed decision prior to taking any actions related to the material in this report.

You assume all responsibility in connection with selecting a vendor solution, whether or not you obtained information about such solution through this report. The Tambellini Group and its officers, contractors and affiliates assume no (and hereby disclaims all) responsibility of any kind, for any advice, treatment or other services rendered by any vendor or for any other claims that may arise directly or indirectly from such advice or other services.

THIS REPORT IS PROVIDED ON AN "AS IS" AND "AS AVAILABLE" BASIS, AND IS INTENDED FOR INFORMATIONAL PURPOSES ONLY. WHILE WE STRIVE TO PROVIDE THE MOST UP TO DATE INFORMATION AVAILABLE, THE REPORT MAY CONTAIN TECHNICAL OR OTHER INACCURACIES OR TYPOGRAPHICAL ERRORS, AND MAY BE CHANGED OR UPDATED WITHOUT NOTICE.

WAIVER OF WARRANTIES. THE TAMBELLINI GROUP MAKES NO REPRESENTATIONS OR WARRANTIES WITH RESPECT TO THE REPORT AND ANY AND ALL THE TAMBELLINI GROUP SERVICES PROVIDED TO YOU. THE TAMBELLINI GROUP HEREBY EXPRESSLY DISCLAIMS ANY AND ALL WARRANTIES, WHETHER EXPRESS, IMPLIED, OR STATUTORY, INCLUDING WITHOUT LIMITATION, ANY IMPLIED WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY, FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE, NON-INFRINGEMENT, AND ANY WARRANTIES CONCERNING THE AVAILABILITY, RELIABILITY, COMPLETENESS, AND/OR QUALITY WITH REGARD TO THE REPORT AND ANY AND ALL THE TAMBELLINI GROUP SERVICES PROVIDED TO YOU.

The terms in this report will be governed by and interpreted in accordance with the laws of the Commonwealth of Virginia, without regard to the conflict of laws and rules thereof, and may be amended only in writing signed by The Tambellini Group. You agree any violation of the trade secret provisions herein may cause irreparable harm and damage to The Tambellini Group. For this reason, you agree The Tambellini Group may seek injunctive relief for your breach, in addition to other remedies at law or in equity, without having to prove damages or post bond. In all court proceedings brought in connection with this report and/or The Tambellini Group's services provided to you, the parties hereto irrevocably consent to exclusive personal jurisdiction by, and venue in, the courts of the City of Richmond, Virginia and the United States District Court for the Eastern District of Virginia.